



**THE STATES assembled on Wednesday  
29th June 2011, at 09.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of the Bailiff,  
Michael Cameron St. John Birt Esquire.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Paul Francis Routier – absent on States business  
Senator Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf – excused attendance (arrived in the Chamber at 10.34 a.m.)  
Senator James Leslie Perchard – excused attendance  
Senator Alan John Henry Maclean – excused attendance  
Connétable John Le Sueur Gallichan of Trinity – excused attendance  
Connétable Silvanus Arthur Yates of St. Martin – excused attendance  
Connétable Juliette Gallichan of St. Mary – excused attendance  
Deputy Judith Ann Martin of St. Helier – excused attendance  
Deputy Carolyn Fiona Labey of Grouville – absent on States business  
Deputy Shona Pitman of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.10 a.m.)  
Deputy Ian Joseph Gorst of St. Clement – absent on States business  
Deputy Trevor Mark Pitman of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.24 a.m.)  
Deputy Anne Teresa Dupré of St. Clement – excused attendance  
Deputy Michael Roderick Higgins of St. Helier – excused attendance

---

Prayers

---

**Documents presented or laid**

Land Transactions under Standing Order 168(3) – Lime Grove House acquisition – in principle. R.78/2011.  
Presented: 29th June 2011.  
*Minister for Treasury and Resources.*

**Notification of lodged propositions**

Island Plan 2011: approval (P.48/2011): fifty-eighth amendment. P.48/2011.  
Lodged: 29th June 2011. Amd.(58)  
*Minister for Planning and Environment.*

**Withdrawal of lodged propositions**

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), the proposers of the following propositions lodged “au Greffe” had informed the Greffier of the States that they had been withdrawn –

Island Plan 2011: approval (P.48/2011): eleventh amendment. P.48/2011.  
Lodged: 20th April 2011. Amd.(11)  
*Deputy I.J. Gorst of St. Clement.*

Island Plan 2011: approval (P.48/2011): eleventh amendment (P.48/2011 Amd.(11)) – amendment. P.48/2011.  
Lodged: 10th May 2011. Amd.(11)  
*Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire of St. Helier.* Amd.

North St. Helier Masterplan (P.73/2011): fourth amendment. P.73/2011.  
Lodged: 20th June 2011. Amd.(4)  
*Minister for Planning and Environment.*

### **Island Plan 2011: approval (P.48/2011)**

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Minister for Planning and Environment concerning the approval of the Island Plan 2011 (P.48/2011) and an amendment of Deputy Ian Joseph Gorst of St. Clement (Amendment 11) and an amendment to that amendment by Deputy Paul Vincent Francis Le Claire of St. Helier that field numbers 21A, 38, 38A, 39 and 59A should be deleted.

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Minister for Planning and Environment, agreed that, in accordance with the provisions of paragraph (4) of Article 4A of the Planning and Building (Jersey) Law 2002, Amendment (58) lodged ‘au Greffe’ by the Minister for Planning and Environment could be considered during the debate on the ‘Island Plan 2011: approval’.

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of the Minister for Planning and Environment (Amendment (58)), agreed that after the words “the revised draft Island Plan 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the Proposals Map forming part of the Island Plan should be amended to clarify that the following land parcels, which are in the Green Zone but shown on the Proposals Map as within the boundary line of the surrounding Built-Up Area, are clearly excluded from the Built-Up Area –

- (a) Fields 21A, 38, 38A, 39, 41, 42, 44, 45, 46, 47, 48, 48, 48A, 49, 50, 51, 52, 53, 54, 59, 59A, 59B, 80–88, 97, 98, and 100 in the parish of St. Clement;
- (b) Fields 1550 and 1551 in the parish of St. Helier;
- (c) Fields 865, 866, 875, 877, 878, 879 and 880 in the parish of St. Lawrence;
- (d) Fields 500, 501, 501A, 503, 504, 505, 508, 620, 622, 623 and 624 in the parish of St. Saviour.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 36**

**CONTRE: 0**

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Senator T.J. Le Main  
Senator B.E. Shenton  
Senator F.E. Cohen  
Senator A. Breckon  
Senator S.C. Ferguson

Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of Grouville  
Connétable of St. John  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy of St. Ouen  
Deputy of St. Peter  
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
Deputy of Trinity  
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
Deputy of St. John  
Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
Deputy of St. Mary  
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

Following the adoption of the amendment of the Minister for Planning and Environment (Amendment (58)), the Bailiff informed the Assembly that the amendments of Deputy Ian Joseph Gorst of St. Clement (Amendment (11)) and an amendment to that amendment by Deputy Paul Vincent Francis Le Claire of St. Helier were deemed to have been withdrawn.

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 106(1)(a), Deputy Edward James Noel of St. Lawrence declared an interest and withdrew from the Chamber for the duration of the debate on Amendment (11).

THE STATES, adopting the proposition of the Minister for Planning and Environment, as amended, approved, in accordance with Article 3(1) of the Planning and Building (Jersey) Law 2002, the draft Island Plan 2011, as amended.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 37**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F.du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**CONTRE: 1**

Deputy G.P. Southern (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0****Arrangement of public business for the present meeting**

THE STATES rejected a proposition of the Deputy of St. Mary that the meeting should adjourn for 5 minutes.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 6**

Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
Deputy of St. John  
Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
Deputy of St. Mary

**CONTRE: 24**

Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
Senator T.J. Le Main  
Senator F.E. Cohen  
Senator A. Breckon  
Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
Deputy of St. Ouen  
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**ABSTAIN: 0****North St. Helier Masterplan P.73/2011**

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of the Minister for Planning and Environment regarding the adoption of the North St. Helier Masterplan dated 10th May 2011 (P.73/2011) and, adopting paragraph 2 of an amendment of Deputy John Alexander Nicholas Le Fondré of St. Lawrence, agreed that after the words “an agreed development framework” there should be inserted the words –

“subject to the condition that references in the draft Masterplan to the provision of affordable housing being fixed initially at a proportion of 12½% shall be amended to provide that the proportion shall be fixed in accordance with any agreed Policy in the Island Plan.”.

THE STATES, adopting paragraph 1 of an amendment of the Deputy of St. Mary to the proposition of the Minister for Planning and Environment (P.73/2011), agreed that after the words “an agreed development framework” –

(a) there should be inserted the words –

“subject to the condition that after the words on page 3 of the draft Masterplan ‘A developer tariff will be worked up for the entire area to contribute towards public realm and transport solutions,’ there be inserted the words ‘This tariff and any other similar funding mechanisms from developers will be set immediately by the Minister, so that they will apply to any developments under the Masterplan’.”.

- (b) after the words added by paragraph (a) there should be inserted the words “and will then be brought to the States for endorsement by the Assembly”.

THE STATES rejected paragraph 4 of an amendment of the Deputy of St. Mary to the proposition of the Minister for Planning and Environment (P.73/2011), that after the words “an agreed development framework” there should be inserted the words –

“subject to the condition that the funding streams resulting from the developer tariff mentioned on page 3 of the draft Masterplan and from the “contributions from private developments” and the “capital released from States development” mentioned in paragraph 29 of the Report to P.73, and from the Planning Obligation Agreement procedure mentioned in paragraph 82 of the Report to P.73, shall be used primarily to finance improvements to the public realm including but not limited to pedestrian routes, cycling routes, and improvements to urban public transport such as a Hoppa service or services, as envisaged in the Masterplan, and in accordance with the Island Plan and the Sustainable Transport Policy”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 11**

Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)

**CONTRE: 27**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

**Arrangement of business for the present meeting**

THE STATES agreed that it would reconvene on Thursday 30th June 2011 at 11.00 a.m. following the special meeting to commemorate the departure of His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor, Lieutenant-General Sir Andrew Ridgway, K.B.E., C.B.

**Changes in Presidency**

THE STATES re-assembled after the lunch adjournment under the Presidency of Mr. Michael Nelson de la Haye, Greffier of the States.

**North St. Helier Masterplan P.73/2011**

THE STATES resumed consideration of a proposition of the Minister for Planning and Environment regarding the adoption of the North St. Helier Masterplan dated 10th May 2011 (P.73/2011) and, adopting paragraph 2 of an amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier, agreed that after the words “an agreed development framework” there should be inserted the words –

“subject to the condition that the plan to create environmental improvements in Bath Street and David Place by making these roads one-way will be subject to further investigation and consultation before being discounted”.

**Changes in Presidency**

Mr. Michael Nelson de la Haye, Greffier of the States, retired from the Chair during consideration of paragraph 2 of the amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier to the North St. Helier Masterplan (P.73/2011) and the meeting continued under the Presidency of the Bailiff.

**North St. Helier Masterplan P.73/2011**

THE STATES, adopting paragraph 2 of an amendment of the Deputy of St. Mary, agreed that after the words “an agreed development framework” there should be inserted the words –

“subject to the condition that in relation to the Ann Court site, a full consultation with relevant stakeholders will be carried out with regard to the site being used, in whole or in part, for social and/or market housing for the elderly, and that if the consultation outcome is positive about the scheme, that a feasibility study will be carried out to progress this use of the site”.

THE STATES commenced consideration of paragraph 1 of an amendment of Deputy John Alexander Nicholas Le Fondré of St. Lawrence to the proposition of the Minister for Planning and Environment (P.73/2011) and granted him leave to withdraw the amendment.

THE STATES, adopting paragraph 1 of an amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier to the North St. Helier Masterplan (P.73/2011), agreed that after the words “an agreed development framework” there should be inserted the words –

“subject to the condition that any plans for the redevelopment of –

- (a) the Ann Court site;
- (b) the Jersey Gas site,

shall take into account any requirements in the new Island Plan that sufficient amenity space and parking for shoppers and residents be provided in the area of the Masterplan”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 25**

**CONTRE: 9**

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)

Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

THE STATES rejected paragraph 6 of an amendment of the Deputy of St. Mary to the North St. Helier Masterplan (P.73/2011), that after the words “an agreed development framework” there should be inserted the words –

“subject to the condition that the commuter parking proposed for the Le Masurier Bath Street shall be deleted from the Masterplan.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 9**

**CONTRE: 19**

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)

Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson



Deputy G.P. Southern (H)	Connétable of St. Ouen
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)	Connétable of Grouville
Deputy S. Pitman (H)	Connétable of St. Brelade
Deputy of St. Mary	Connétable of St. John
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)	Connétable of St. Saviour
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)	Connétable of St. Clement
	Connétable of St. Lawrence
	Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
	Deputy of St. Martin
	Deputy of Trinity
	Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
	Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
	Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
	Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
	Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
	Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

THE STATES commenced consideration of paragraph 3 of an amendment of the Deputy of St. Mary to the North St. Helier Masterplan (P.73/2011), that after the words “an agreed development framework” there should be inserted the words –

“subject to the condition that in relation to the former Jersey College for Girls site, the draft Masterplan shall be amended to include a formal evaluation of this site as a site for States offices”.

### **Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Thursday 30th June 2011 at 11.00 a.m. to continue consideration of the proposition of the Minister for Planning and Environment entitled ‘North St. Helier Masterplan’ (P.73/2011) and the outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 5.03 p.m.

**M.N. DE LA HAYE**

*Greffier of the States*